## quinn emanuel trial lawyers | new york

51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor, New York, New York 10010-1601 | TEL (212) 849-7000 FAX (212) 849-7100

USDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #:
DATE FILED: 6/13/2022

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NO. **212-849-7655** 

WRITER'S EMAIL ADDRESS lindamoon@quinnemanuel.com

February 15, 2022

## Via ECF

Honorable Katharine Parker United States Magistrate Judge United States District Court 500 Pearl St. New York, NY 10007 A discovery conference is scheduled for July 11, 2022 at 3:00 p.m. At the scheduled time, counsel shall call Judge Parker's conference line. Please dial (866) 434-5269; Code: 4858267.

SO ORDERED:

HON. KATHARINE H. PARKER UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

6/13/2022

Re: Capak v. Epps, et al., No. 18-CV-4325 (RA) (KHP)

## Dear Judge Parker:

We are counsel to Defendant Rory Smith in the above-referenced action, and we respectfully submit this letter in response to the Court's Order (ECF No. 129) to address certain pre-trial discovery issues with Your Honor.

As newly assigned counsel, we respectfully request that the Court permit Mr. Smith to (1) obtain documents that both Defendants in this case previously requested from Plaintiff but never received, and (2) depose any expert witnesses whose testimony Plaintiff intends to rely on at trial.

While we are mindful that the Court previously deemed discovery completed, we believe "good cause" exists in this case for discovery to be reopened for limited purposes. *See Fischer v. Verizon New York, Inc.*, No. 18-CV-11628 (RA), 2021 WL 5827639, at \*4 (S.D.N.Y. Dec. 8, 2021) (quoting *Gray v. Town of Darien*, 927 F.2d 69, 74 (2d Cir. 1991)); Fed. R. Civ. P. 16(b)(4) ("A schedule may be modified only for good cause and with the judge's consent."). Here, Plaintiff is well-aware of the requests specified in this letter and is under a continuing obligation to supplement his responses. *See* Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e) ("A party who has made a disclosure under Rule 26(a) . . . must supplement . . . its disclosure or response . . . in a timely manner if the party learns that in some material respect the disclosure or response is incomplete or incorrect,

and if the additional corrective information has not otherwise been made known to the other parties during the discovery process or in writing[.]").

Specifically, during a deposition held on November 12, 2019, Plaintiff referenced at least three items responsive to Defendants' discovery requests. Defendants subsequently made explicit requests for those items as specified below, but Plaintiff never produced them.

- The records from Plaintiff's visit to a New Jersey emergency room following an automobile accident in 2015 and/or 2016 and records related to subsequent treatments Plaintiff received. *See* Excerpt of Deposition of R.J. Capak ("Capak Depo.") (attached hereto as Exhibit A) at 203:6–205:24; *id.* at 219:19–22; *see also* ECF No. 108 (Defendant's letter requesting extension of time to complete expert discovery); ECF No. 114 (joint status letter informing the Court that Defendant was unable to obtain the medical records from the third-party provider).
- A video taken by a third-party and referenced in Plaintiff's deposition, *see* Capak Depo. at 85:14–16 ("As a matter of fact, I got somebody's video, and the guy yelled out, that guy knocked him out, man."), and requested by Defendant Epp's counsel, *see id.* at 179:17–180:18.
- Any statements Harry Velez provided to anyone relating to the October 17, 2017 incident, such as those made to the NYPD and the district attorney's office. See Capak Depo. at 195:14–196:24.

We contacted Plaintiff's counsel by email in an effort to obtain his agreement to the production of the foregoing items and to discuss the availability of any potential expert witness Plaintiff intends to call as a witness. As of the filing of this letter, we have received no response.

For the foregoing reasons, Mr. Smith respectfully requests that the Court reopen discovery for the limited purposes requested herein.

Very truly yours,				
<u>/s/ L</u>	inda Moon			
	a Moon I. Park			
cc:	Harris Marks Sanford Alan Rubenstein			
	Rory Smith			

## **EXHIBIT A**

```
Page 82
                                                                                                                    Page 84
         am already at my spot. I am already videotaping,
                                                                1
                                                                                  I don't know. I'm not looking at them,
2
         and then I see Rory just comes, he just comes
                                                                2
                                                                        but I know that they got out of the car, and I
3
         charging towards me at that point, while 2 Chainz is
                                                                        assume they are going up with him. I'm not
         walking with the dog. So Rory is out in front of
 4
                                                                        recollecting the other people at this point. I'm
5
         everybody.
                                                                        just, you know, but you can see in the first part of
 6
               Q. So according to you, they are in a
                                                                6
                                                                        my video everybody coming out, everybody doing what
 7
         single-file line?
                                                                        they are doing.
 8
               A. I didn't say single file. I don't know
                                                                8
                                                                                    Do you remember what 2 Chainz was
                                                                               Q.
9
         what they are walking in. I am just saying I
                                                                9
                                                                        wearing?
10
        believe they were behind 2 Chainz. I may be wrong.
                                                               10
                                                                                    Anything else?
11
         You've got to look at the video. Why don't we look
                                                               11
         at the video?
                                                               12
                                                                                    Jumpsuit. It looked like a sweat jump,
12
                                                                               Α.
13
               0.
                   Because I want to get your recollection
                                                               13
                                                                        you know, type of suit.
14
         right now.
                                                               14
                                                                               Q. Jewelry, sunglasses?
                                                               15
                                                                                   I don't remember all of that. I just
15
               A. Okay.
16
               O. So --
                                                               16
                                                                        remember it was kind of like a red outfit. It
17
               A. But I don't remember where everybody was
                                                               17
                                                                        looked like a, you know, sweats-type outfit.
18
         except for 2 Chainz and Rory. That is all I am
                                                               18
                                                                               Q. Anything else?
19
         concentrating on. I could care less about everybody
                                                               19
                                                                               A. I wasn't really looking. Especially in
20
         else.
                                                               20
                                                                        the lobby. You know, I wasn't really looking.
21
                   I understand, but you indicated an
                                                               21
                                                                               Q. Okay. So they are walking in, and what
22
         entourage of five or six people comes walking in
                                                               22
                                                                        happens next?
23
         through the special doors, and they are not single
                                                               23
                                                                               A. They are walking in, and Rory has
24
         file?
                                                               24
                                                                        2 Chainz' crutch, and he just comes walking towards
25
                                                               25
                                                                        me, and as he's walking towards me, he pulls the
               A. I don't know what order they are in.
                                                    Page 83
                                                                                                                    Page 85
1
               Q. Okay.
                                                                        crutch up, so it is like now parallel to the ground,
2
                   And I didn't say they are single file.
                                                                        and he is coming right for my head, and I am like,
3
         I don't know what they are doing. I'm
                                                                        okay, he can't be doing this, you know what I mean?
4
         concentrating, there might have been a couple or two
                                                                        So I am like ignoring it, ignoring it, and then the
5
         or three that shot up ahead of him. I don't know.
                                                                5
                                                                        next thing I know he is trying to put his hand on
 6
         I am just looking for 2 Chainz. I don't care about
                                                                6
                                                                        the camcorder, and I am backing up the whole time as
 7
         anybody else.
                                                                7
                                                                        he's coming towards me, and then the next thing I
8
               Q. Several people shot ahead?
                                                                        know I am out.
9
                                                                9
                                                                               Q. And that is what you believe occurred?
                   I'm quessing. I don't know. I don't
10
                                                                               A. I can see it in the video. I saw the
        know.
                                                               10
11
               Q. Okay. So they are not in a single file.
                                                               11
                                                                        NBC video. When I woke up and everybody was like
12
         You are sure of that?
                                                               12
                                                                        are you okay, and they are helping me to my feet. I
13
                    Yeah. No. I don't think they would be
                                                               13
                                                                        was like what happened? Did he hit me, and they
14
         in a single file. It is not a narrow corridor. It
                                                               14
                                                                        were like yeah. They said, you were out, dude. As
15
         is a wide lobby.
                                                               15
                                                                        a matter of fact, I got somebody's video, and the
16
               Q. So you have got five or six people
                                                               16
                                                                        guy yelled out, that guy knocked him out, man. I
17
        walking your way?
                                                               17
                                                                        was, oh, my God.
18
                   They're walking -- not walking. If I am
                                                               18
                                                                                   So tell me what the person with the
                                                                               Ο.
19
         over here, they are over there. That is what it
                                                               19
                                                                        crutch was doing?
20
        looks like. I am here, and they are walking along
                                                               20
                                                                                   He was menacing me, coming towards me.
21
         there, and then they go right and left. I'm not in
                                                               21
                                                                        He was coming towards me like he was jousting me or
22
                                                               22
         front of them in any way. I am off at an angle.
                                                                        something.
23
               Q. Okay. When this group of people is
                                                               23
                                                                                   Do you know what the purpose of what
                                                                               Q.
24
        walking, I guess towards the elevator, and they are
                                                               24
                                                                        this person was trying to do?
```

25

A. He was trying to hurt me.

25

walking towards the elevator?

	Page 178		Page 180
1	alleged herein in any manner whatsoever."	1	my files.
2	A. Okay.	2	Q. Do you know if that video has been
3	Q. Do you know what that means?	3	produced by your lawyers in this case?
4	A. That means that I didn't cause the	4	A. I don't think so.
5	situation, I guess.	5	MR. YOUNG: Okay. Well, I will just
6	Q. Okay. Do you believe that to be	6	make that request on the record that it be
7	accurate?	7	produced.
8	A. Sure.	8	MR. SCHWARTZ: Did you give it to us?
9	Q. And why?	9	THE WITNESS: No.
10	A. Why would I? I wasn't doing anything	10	MR. SCHWARTZ: Can we have it, please?
11	that was threatening.	11	THE WITNESS: If you ask nicely.
12	Q. You mentioned earlier that you had	12	MR. SCHWARTZ: If you would like to make
13	swatted at the crutch.	13	any separate written demands, we would be
14	A. That is a menacing act. So you are	14	happy to respond to those separate written
15	trying to say that because I tried to keep myself	15	demands upon receipt of same.
16	from being injured, that somehow I am complicit in	16	MR. YOUNG: Certainly. We will follow
17	this? Is that what you are saying?	17	up in writing.
18	Q. My question is to you.	18	MR. SCHWARTZ: Thank you.
19	A. Yeah. What is the question?	19	Q. Do you have any recollection let me
20	Q. The question is do you view you swatting	20	start over. I believe you testified you recall
21	away the crutch as any evidence of contributing to	21	swatting away the crutch and not remembering what
22	the incident?	22	happened next. Is that right?
23	A. No, not at all.	23	A. Right.
24	Q. Do you view your actions of being in the	24	Q. Okay. So you don't know what you did or
25	lobby of 30 Rock at all contributing to the	25	said to Mr. Smith at that point? Is that correct?
1	Page 179 incident?	1	Page 181  A. There was nothing that I could have said
2	A. No.	2	that warranted him taking me and knocking me out.
3	Q. Okay. Do you view anything that you did	3	Q. Okay. Is there anything you could have
4	on the day of the incident contributed to the	4	done?
5	accident?	5	A. There is nothing I have done except swat
6	A. No.	6	away the crutch, as far as I know, and again, there
7	Q. Do you know how many videos exist of the	7	is nothing I could be doing except defending myself,
8	incident?	8	something along those lines there.
9	A. I can only assume my video and NBC's	9	Q. Okay. When you say defending yourself,
10	video. Now, if somebody else took any, I am not	10	defending yourself from what exactly?
11	privy to that except for that one video that I	11	A. From him being in my face and hurting
12	mentioned, but I believe that was after the fact. I	12	me.
13	am already sitting in the background I think with my	13	Q. Okay, but the thing that was in your
14	head bandaged, so it is not of the incident. It is	14	face you said was the soft end of the crutch?
15	after the incident of some guy saying that guy	15	A. The crutch. It just happened to have a
16	knocked him out.	16	rubber tip on it, but are you saying that was okay
17	Q. Okay, and this third video that you are	17	to assault me with, because it had a rubber tip on
18	mentioning, who took that video?	18	it?
19	A. I don't know. I think it was a fan that	19	Q. I am asking if you viewed that as a
20	posted it to social media, and I was able to	20	threat. That's the question.
21	download it real quick.	21	A. The whole crutch is a threat.
22	Q. Have you seen that video?	22	Q. The whole crutch is a threat because
1	2 1		
23	A. I have seen that video.	23	it's in your face?
	•	23 24	it's in your face?  A. It's coming at my face, and I don't know

	110 V CILIDET	-2,	2019
	Page 194		Page 196
1	we looked at in the last exhibit. This is where you	1	A. I don't think he is in my video. I
2	verify that you have read the foregoing, know the	2	believe he is behind me.
3	contents thereof, and you believe the same is true,	3	Q. Was he talking to you? Did you have any
4	to your own knowledge, except as to the matters	4	communications with him?
5	therein stated to be alleged upon information and	5	A. No. I didn't even really, you know,
6	belief, and as to those matters, I believe it to be	6	acknowledge him being there.
7	true.	7	Q. Do you know what Harry Velez did
8	Do you see that?	8	subsequent to the incident?
9	A. I do, but what is this here where it	9	A. What do you mean?
10	says the name signed must be printed underneath? Is	10	Q. In terms of did he help you?
11	it my name that is supposed to be there?	11	A. He helped me get up, and then he was
12	Q. Well, I can't answer any questions from	12	like, are you okay, and I said, do me a favor, take
13	you today, but I'm happy for you to talk to your own	13	some pictures, so he did.
14	lawyer.	14	Q. Okay. What did he take pictures of, to
15	A. Whose name is supposed to be on this	15	your knowledge?
16	document? I want to make sure it's valid.	16	A. Me sitting in the chair, my head
17	MR. SCHWARTZ: In theory, your name	17	bleeding, people aiding me. Stuff like that.
18	would be typed underneath the signature.	18	Q. Okay. Do you know if Mr. Velez has
19	THE WITNESS: So it is a faulty	19	provided a statement to the police or to anyone?
20	document, in other words. Okay.	20	A. I believe he gave a witness statement.
21	Q. So let's turn to page 1 which carries	21	MR. YOUNG: For the record, we will
22	over to page 2. It is labeled interrogatory number	22	follow up in writing for a copy of any
23	2 on the first page. Do you see that?	23	statements that Mr. Velez has provided to
24	A. I do.	24	anyone relating to this incident.
25	Q. Okay. It says "Identify each and every	25	MR. SCHWARTZ: We look forward to,
1	Page 195	1	Page 197
1	person who possesses knowledge of any facts relevant	1	following the conclusion of this oral
2	to the subject matter." Then it continues. I want	2	examination, our receipt of a separate
3	to focus on your response, which is on the following	3	written demand, and upon our receipt of same
4	page.	4	we will be happy to respond.
5	You reference Harry Velez, who is	5	Q. Okay. Other than Mr. Velez, you did
6	employed as an autographer as someone who possesses	6	reference other people that you thought were there
7	knowledge relevant.	7	at the scene?
8	A. He's a photographer. He was the guy	8	A. Other people were there, but he's the
9	that was there that took the pictures of me and	9	one who basically saw what happened.
10	helped me up and stuff.	10	Q. Okay, and to your knowledge, none of the
11	Q. Okay. Autographer, is that a	11	other people you reference today saw what happened.
12	profession. It is unfamiliar to me. What is it?	12	Is that right?
13	A. They get celebrity autographs.	13	A. Saw the actual striking of me, no. I
14	Q. Okay. What did Harry Velez witness, to	14	believe Marie and Sam I believe were over to the
15	your knowledge?	15	left, and I believe Harry was back behind me
16	A. He was the one that was closest to me.	16	somewhere and off to the side, because I think he
17	Q. Closest to you at what point in time?	17	was outside too and came running in or something
18	A. When the incident happened. He said he	18	like that. I'm not sure.
19	was like I think he said he was just off to the side	19	I just noted that he said he saw it, and
20	and behind me, I believe he said.	20	he was the first one there to help me up, him and
21	Q. What was he wearing that day?	21	then Sam came running over, and Marie came over.
22	A. I don't know. I don't even know what I	22	Q. Okay, and did Mr. Velez tell you what he
23	was wearing.	23	witnessed?
1.24	O To be receipted a description black receipted	1.774	7 Thousand the Tacture Tact and Add he

24

25

A. I believe when I got up, I said did he

hit me, and he said, hell, yeah, something to that

Q. Is he visible in the video that you took

or that you're aware of?

24 25

	Page 202		Page 204
1	were in a car accident?	1	weird name, the town. I don't remember.
2	A. I think I was in a car accident, I think	2	Q. Okay. So you testified that you didn't
3	it was like two years before. I was sitting at a	3	think you were hurt at first, but subsequently you
4	red light, and I got rear-ended. Thank God, there	4	thought you were.
5	was a cop car right there.	5	A. Well, they thought I looked a little
6	Q. Where were you?	6	pale, I guess, or something, you know or something
7	A. Where was I? We were just coming back	7	because they said, look, you need to be checked out.
8	from I guess Seaside Heights in New Jersey.	8	You don't look so good. I was like okay. I think I
9	Q. Okay. Were you in New York or New	9	was just, you know, shocked, because it was my
10	Jersey?	10	father's car, and he died, and my mom gave it to me,
11	A. New Jersey.	11	and now it is totaled.
12	Q. Okay. Were you on the driver's side?	12	Q. What injuries were you diagnosed with?
13	A. Yeah, I was driving.	13	A. They just said it looks like, if
14	Q. Okay, and somebody rear-ended you?	14	anything, it could be a case of whiplash.
15	A. He was on his phone.	15	Q. Okay. And that was what was diagnosed
16	Q. Do you know how fast he was going?	16	at the ER?
17	A. No.	17	A. Yeah, that is what the doctor said after
18	Q. Roughly approximate speed?	18	looking at the x-ray. He said, you know, I don't
19	A. Oh, I couldn't. How do I know? I	19	see anything, so if anything, it is probably a mild
20	didn't see him hit me. I just, you know, heard the	20	case of whiplash. He goes you might feel sore in a
21	screech, and by the time I even looked up, the	21	couple of days, but you know, just put hot
22	impact. I mean, you know.	22	compresses on it and you should be okay.
23	Q. Was the car totaled?	23	Q. Did you have any subsequent treatment
24	A. Yeah, they totaled it. It was a 2008	24	plans that you had to follow?
25	Accord, and he kind of pushed in the left side of	25	A. No. Well, I felt a little stiff after
	Page 203		Page 205
1	Page 203 the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the	1	Page 205 that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told
1 2	9	1 2	9
	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the		that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told
2	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than	2 3 4	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so
2 3 4 5	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?	2 3	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if
2 3 4	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at	2 3 4	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy. Q. How long did physical therapy last? A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and
2 3 4 5 6 7	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted	2 3 4 5 6 7	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of	2 3 4 5 6 7	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.  Q. You were at an ER? Where did you go?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?  A. I don't even like taking aspirin, but
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.  Q. You were at an ER? Where did you go?  A. An ambulance came to take my passenger,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?  A. I don't even like taking aspirin, but now I have gotta.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.  Q. You were at an ER? Where did you go?  A. An ambulance came to take my passenger, so I sat in the passenger seat and just hopped the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?  A. I don't even like taking aspirin, but now I have gotta.  Q. So is it correct that, after the ten
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.  Q. You were at an ER? Where did you go?  A. An ambulance came to take my passenger, so I sat in the passenger seat and just hopped the ride. I couldn't take the car.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?  A. I don't even like taking aspirin, but now I have gotta.  Q. So is it correct that, after the ten weeks or so of physical therapy, you didn't continue
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.  Q. You were at an ER? Where did you go?  A. An ambulance came to take my passenger, so I sat in the passenger seat and just hopped the ride. I couldn't take the car.  Q. Do you know what hospital you went to?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?  A. I don't even like taking aspirin, but now I have gotta.  Q. So is it correct that, after the ten weeks or so of physical therapy, you didn't continue any kind of treatment?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.  Q. You were at an ER? Where did you go?  A. An ambulance came to take my passenger, so I sat in the passenger seat and just hopped the ride. I couldn't take the car.  Q. Do you know what hospital you went to?  A. No, I don't.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?  A. I don't even like taking aspirin, but now I have gotta.  Q. So is it correct that, after the ten weeks or so of physical therapy, you didn't continue any kind of treatment?  A. No. Everything seemed okay. I had some
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	the trunk, and because I guess they bent part of the frame, they decided it was cheaper to total it than to try to fix it.  Q. And what injuries did you sustain in that car accident?  A. Well, I didn't sustain any injuries at first I didn't think, but when my passenger wanted to be checked out, she was hurt, and so I am sitting in the hospital there, and I just remember one of the nurses coming over and say you don't look so good and said, you know, let's get him checked out, and I didn't want to, but she said, look, you need to be checked out. So we got checked out. They did a CAT scan on me. They said everything looked good. If anything, it is probably a case, you know, of maybe whiplash or something.  Q. You were at an ER? Where did you go?  A. An ambulance came to take my passenger, so I sat in the passenger seat and just hopped the ride. I couldn't take the car.  Q. Do you know what hospital you went to?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	that, and so, you know, I went to the VA, and I told them about it, and they put me in physical therapy.  Q. How long did physical therapy last?  A. I think it was like maybe ten visits, so I am going to say ten weeks. Maybe, I don't know if I went twice a week for the first week or two and then maybe once a week after that. I really don't remember.  Q. Who was the passenger in the vehicle?  A. Marie Arnold, my girlfriend.  Q. That is the same Marie we talked about earlier?  A. Yes.  Q. Other than the physical therapy, did you take any other medications or have any other treatment plan?  A. I don't even like taking aspirin, but now I have gotta.  Q. So is it correct that, after the ten weeks or so of physical therapy, you didn't continue any kind of treatment?

25

that I like. It just feels like it does something.

25

give me a minute. I'm not like I was. It is a

```
Page 218
                                                                                                                   Page 220
1
         in an MRI?
                                                                                     MR. SCHWARTZ: I don't know if that is
                                                                2
2
               A. I have no idea.
                                                                                necessary or appropriate, but if you would be
3
                    Let's turn to page 11. I want to focus
                                                                                so happy as to follow up in a separate
 4
         on the second paragraph here. This is a report
                                                                                written demand, we would be happy to respond
5
         prepared by at the top Spine & Orthopaedic
                                                                                to that separate written demand upon our
 6
         Rehabilitation. The date is December 6, 2017. Do
                                                                                receipt of same.
 7
         you see that?
                                                                                Q. I just want to turn now back to the
 8
               A.
                   Yes.
                                                                         prior exhibit which is going to be 24. Do you have
9
                    Just focusing on that second paragraph
                                                                 9
                                                                         that in front of you still? The interrogatory
10
         where it begins "He has a history," it says "He has
                                                                10
                                                                         responses.
11
         a history of a motor vehicle accident in June 2015.
                                                                                     I just want to focus now on the laundry
        He believes the left shoulder was the most painful.
                                                                        list of injuries that I guess are on page 10 of that
12
                                                                12
13
        He vaguely remembers he may have had some right
                                                                13
14
         shoulder and neck pain initially also."
                                                                14
                                                                               A. Again, I don't understand medical
                    Do you see that?
                                                                15
15
                                                                         terminology here, so.
16
               A. I do see that.
                                                                16
                                                                                Q. No, that's fine. To the best of your
17
               Q. Okay. Do you recall having pain?
                                                                17
                                                                         ability, I just want to understand how these
18
                A. No, again, you know, when you are
                                                                18
                                                                         injuries relate to the incident and how exactly you
19
         talking to the doctor, you know, what I am saying
                                                                19
                                                                         understand you suffered the injury as a result of
20
         and evidently, you know, what they write down could
                                                                20
                                                                         the incident.
21
        be two different things, so I don't know, you know.
                                                                21
                                                                               A. Well, I mean I was knocked off my feet.
22
         It is interesting. I mean they say something. It
                                                                22
                                                                         I landed on I would assume my back, shoulder blades
                                                                         and my head. The head obviously hit the floor, and
23
         is almost a little different from what they said
                                                                23
24
         initially the first time I was there, so I don't
                                                                24
                                                                         it must have hit it in such a way that I mean it
25
        know if they are reading their own notes or what
                                                                25
                                                                         didn't crack open, but as you stated earlier, it was
                                                   Page 219
                                                                                                                   Page 221
1
         they are doing over there. I have no idea.
                                                                         an abrasion. I guess, you know, the skin is broken.
2
                    Okay. So is it wrong that you suffered
                                                                        You are bleeding.
3
         injuries to your left and right shoulder and neck?
                                                                                     So I don't see how that happened. I
4
                A. I guess the only thing that I remember
                                                                         must have slid on the floor or something, because,
5
         was my neck from the car accident. It's the only
                                                                         you know, just hitting it, I can't see how that
 6
         thing that I really remember.
                                                                         would have caused an abrasion. I can see if it
 7
                    Just to be clear, other than the
                                                                 7
                                                                         split open and I needed, you know, something else,
 8
        physical therapy, you didn't engage in any other
                                                                 8
                                                                         so I don't know, but after that is when all this
9
         treatment subsequent to the car accident?
                                                                         started. That's when my neck, my shoulder blades,
10
                                                                         lower back, my head especially. My head and my neck
                   Subsequent to the car accident, you mean
                                                               10
         after the car accident?
11
                                                                11
                                                                         are the big ones. When I am sleeping at night, now
12
                Q. After the car accident, yes.
                                                                12
                                                                         it is my shoulders, because I am tossing and I am
13
                   As I mentioned earlier, yes, I went in
                                                                13
                                                                         turning, and this has been nonstop.
14
        and I got treatment at the VA with the physical
                                                                14
                                                                                   Okay, and The list of injuries that are
15
        therapy.
                                                                15
                                                                         on the page in response to interrogatory 5, are
16
                                                               16
                                                                         these all injuries that a doctor or medical
                Q. And other than the physical therapy, you
17
         did no other treatment?
                                                                17
                                                                        professional has stated was the result of the
18
               A. No, not that I remember. No.
                                                                18
                                                                        October 2017 incident or are these injuries that you
19
                    MR. YOUNG: Just for the record, and we
                                                                19
                                                                        understand were caused by the incident?
20
                will follow up in writing, we will want all
                                                                20
                                                                                   These are what I believe to be caused by
21
                records related to the car accident and the
                                                                21
                                                                        Rory.
22
                subsequent treatment as well.
                                                                22
                                                                               Q. And when you say Rory, you mean the
23
                    THE WITNESS: I don't know where they
                                                                23
                                                                         October 2017 incident?
24
                are. I mean you have got to go to the
                                                                2.4
                                                                               A. Yes, 10/27/17.
25
               hospital.
                                                                               Q. Yes, and just to be clear, October 2017
```